

BARBARA J. CHISHOLM (SBN 224656)
 RACHEL ZWILLINGER (SBN 268684)
 Altshuler Berzon LLP
 177 Post Street, Suite 300
 San Francisco, CA 94108
 Telephone: (415) 421-7151
 E-mail: bchisholm@altber.com
 rzwillinger@altber.com

JOEL R. REYNOLDS (SBN 85276)
 STEPHEN ZAK SMITH (SBN 228913)
 Natural Resources Defense Council
 1314 Second Street
 Santa Monica, CA 90401
 Telephone: (310) 434-2300
 E-mail: jreynolds@nrdc.org
 zsmith@nrdc.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

IGNACIA S. MORENO, Assistant Attorney General
 KEVIN W. McARDLE, Trial Attorney
 MICHAEL D. THORP, Senior Attorney
 United States Department of Justice
 Environment and Natural Resources Division
 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section
 601 D Street, NW, Third Floor
 Washington, DC 20004
 Tele: (202) 305-0219
 E-mail: kevin.mcardle@usdoj.gov
 Michael.Thorp@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Defendants

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE
 COUNCIL, INC., *et al.*,

Plaintiffs

v.

REBECCA BLANK, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No. 12-cv-05380-EDL

**STIPULATION REQUESTING
 REMOVAL FROM THE ADR MULTI-
 OPTION PROGRAM AND
~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER**

1 The undersigned parties appreciate the opportunity to participate in the Court's ADR multi-
 2 option program. The parties, however, agree that the above-captioned administrative review case
 3 is not amenable to an intermediate resolution at this time, none of the ADR processes are likely to
 4 lead to resolution of the case or deliver benefits sufficient to justify the resources consumed by its
 5 use, and the case should continue before the Court. *See* ADR Local Rule 3-5(e)(3). The parties
 6 therefore jointly stipulate and request, pursuant to ADR Local Rule 3-3(c) and Civ. Local Rule 7-
 7 12, that the Court remove the above-captioned case from its ADR multi-option program.

8
 9 Date: December 10, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

11 By: /s/ Barbara J. Chisholm
 12 Barbara J. Chisholm

13 BARBARA J. CHISHOLM
 14 RACHEL ZWILLINGER
 Altshuler Berzon LLP

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

16
 17 Dated: December 10, 2012

18 By: /s/ Kevin W. McArdle, per email authorization
 Kevin W. McArdle

19 KEVIN W. MCARDLE
 20 MICHAEL THORP
 U.S. Department of Justice

21 *Attorneys for Defendants*
 22
 23
 24
 25
 26
 27
 28

[PROPOSED] ORDER

Pursuant to stipulation, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated this 10th day of December, 2012.


THE HONORABLE ELIZABETH D. LAPORTE
United States Magistrate Judge